Karma In The Hinduism And Buddhism Perspective

Husnul Khotimah & Muhammad Sandi Rosyadi

UIN Antasari Banjarmasin

husnulkhatimah@uin-antasari.ac.id, muhammadsandirosyadi@uin-antasari.ac.id

Diterima 10 Juni 2023 | Direview 20 Juni 2023 | Diterbitkan 30 Juni 2023

Abstrak

Artikel ini akan menjelaskan tentang ideologi yang sering disebut "Karma". Penggunaan kata "Karma" secara umum dimaksudkan untuk menggambarkan hal-hal yang tidak baik; karma selalu dikaitkan dengan karma buruk. Faktanya, karma tidak hanya buruk tetapi juga karma baik. Selain sebagai karma buruk, konsep karma juga sering diidentikkan sebagai satu-satunya penyebab kejadian tersebut. Kata "Karma" populer dalam ajaran agama Hindu dan Buddha. Namun, masih banyak kesalahpahaman tentang kata "Karma" itu sendiri yang didefinisikan oleh orang-orang. Seperti Karma dalam Buddhisme adalah doktrin hukuman yang didapat dari perbuatan buruk, ada pula yang menghubungkan buruknya kesehatan manusia sebagai Karma, dan banyak kesalahpahaman tentang karma. Pengertian Karma dilihat dalam perspektif agama Hindu dan Budha. **Kata Kunci:** Agama Buddha; Agama Hindu; Doktrin Karma

a Kunci. Agama Daaana, Agama Hunaa, Dokarin Karma

Abstract

This articel will explain about ideology that often called "Karma". The use of the word "Karma" generally intended to illustrate things that are not good; karma is always associated with bad karma. In fact, karma is not only bad but also good karma. Aside from being a bad karma, karma concept also often identified as the sole cause of the incident. The word "Karma" is popular in the teachings of Hinduism and Buddhism. However, there is still a lot of misunderstanding about the word "Karma" itself defined by people. As with Karma in Buddhism is a doctrine of punishment will be in getting from bad deeds, some are linking the poor health of a human being as Karma, and many misconceptions about karma. Understanding Karma seen in the perspective of Hinduism and Buddhism, while also finding out whether or not the similarity of understanding, teaching, the implementation of the Karma in Hinduism and Buddhism. Keywords: Buddhist Religion; Doctrine Karma; Hinduism Religion

Introduction

In the world there are five major religious sects embraced by many people in every country. Islam, Christian, Catholic, Hindu and Buddhism are the religion fifth scattered all over the world. The five religions have teachings about the same, which automatically also regulates the way of life of its adherents. Infrequently, these teachings also taught in other religions, it is just the way of delivery are slightly different but the value delivered is the same. One example of these teachings is Karma, a lot of people known that karma taught by Hinduism and Buddhism but not many know what Karma sense for the two religions. How did the people of these two religion beliefs about karma? How is the understanding of both religions about karma? In addition, is there a similarity of the doctrine of Karma between the two religions?

As a layperson we have heard the phrase, "Every action must be a cause and effect" is a phrase that is often referred to as "Karma" in the life of our society¹. In general, we understand that every action we did particularly bad deeds will be punish. Meanwhile, for every good work we will definitely get something good as our expectations at the right time. This belief is not only trusted by the people of Hinduism or Buddhism alone but almost the whole of mankind on earth who embrace any religion other than Hinduism and Buddhism. We understand the above belief is not entirely true, because by looking at the trends, people see karma as punishment of any bad acts. Moreover, discussions and critiques of the doctrine of karma often proceed as if there were a single, universally accepted interpretation across various religious traditions, such

¹Bruce R. Reichenbach. (1988). *The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation*. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4 (Oct, 1988), 399-410.

as Hinduism, Jainism, and Ājīvikism. This overlooks the fact that each of these traditions espouses distinct perspectives regarding the nature, mechanisms, and ethical stance toward the purported phenomenon of karma.

A related misconception, stemming in part from this oversimplification, is the assumption that the doctrine of karma inherently promotes a fatalistic worldview. This perspective has been advanced by certain Western scholars—though not all—and has even found acceptance among some South Asian intellectuals, both within and outside Buddhist and Hindu traditions.²

Another significant source of misunderstanding arises from the efforts of certain scholars and individuals to rationalize the doctrine of karma—often unnecessarily—by equating it with social or biological inheritance, or both. This approach not only disregards but also distorts the doctrine's authentic teachings.

Therefore, this paper will discuss the definition and Hindu and Buddhist religious teachings about karma and see whether or not there are similarities between the two religions. The journal divided into several parts; the first part of this paper will briefly describe the background that encourages the writing journal and the purpose of journal writing. The second part will discuss the notion of karma in general, and will be narrow in understanding and teachings of karma in Hinduism and Buddhism separately. The third section discusses whether is there any similarity between the doctrine of karma taught in Hinduism and Buddhism? Lastly, to conclude discussion conducted with reference to the discussion of literature on the two.

Methods

This paper uses a quantitative method with a literature study approach. The literature study research method is a research method that examines and analyzes existing and documented data from various sources, such as books, journals, scientific articles, and others. Literature study research aims to know and understand a problem comprehensively under study.

In research on the karma, the literature study research method can be used to gather information about history, culture, and beliefs. Apart from that, literature study research can also be used to find out how the paradigm of earlier scholars and the thoughts that formed a religious paradigm can be formed so that it influences views on karma beliefs. To collect data, the author can search for and read various literary sources that are relevant to the problems studied. After the data is collected, the author can then perform data analysis using various techniques, such as thematic or qualitative analysis.

Literature Review

The law of karma serves as a fundamental tenet in Hindu, Jain, and Buddhist philosophy. In its simplest form, it asserts that every action inevitably generates consequences that will, at some point in the future, impact the individual who performed the deed. So stated, it might seem that the law of karma is nothing other than the law of universal causation, according to which every action, event, or contingent being is caused. Clearly, the two laws related, though the precise nature of their relation frequently left not clarified. The law of karma variously described by different authors as identical with, parallel to, or an application of the law of universal causation.

²²Bruce R. Reichenbach. (1988). *The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation*. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4 (Oct, 1988), 399-410.

Karma is derived from the word "kr" which is taken from the Sanskrit word which means to move or do.³ That is any motion or activity undertaken, be it intentional or unintentional act. The act is good or bad, right or wrong. Karma is the intention to do something. Actions undertaken by the mind are call karma through the mind⁴; acts committed by the so-called karma through speech utterance; and actions undertaken by the agency called karma through the body. Accordingly, karma could be dividing into good karma and bad karma.

Karma are to be defined in terms of (a) the authors or persons who perform the karmas and (b) the retribution of karmas when it affects simultaneously a large number of persons. Negatively speaking collective karmas are those karmas, which are done, not experienced not by an individual exclusively. Positively speaking collective karmas can be classify into two categories:

(i) 'Group causation' karmas? Caste, class or community acting together jointly;

(ii)Actions giving rise to 'group retribution', is that consequences of actions resulting from transpersonal factors? Regional, national or transnational. In this class, we may also include natural calamities and accidents causing mass or large-scale suffering and destruction. Such retribution, in accordance with the doctrine of karma, deemed to have its genesis in past evil deeds of the victims.⁵

Karma in Hinduism Perspective

In Hindu, an individual destiny is samsara is determined by actions (deeds and thoughts) the person performs. Good deeds eventually bear good consequence, while bad deeds ripen into evil consequences. This natural law, which operates throughout samsara and effects the destiny of the atman is called karma⁶. Karma Phala is causal, therefore all causes would surely bring a result. Likewise, because of a movement or action would lead to a result. Karma also is an act of man while living in the world (to live as God's people, it just did Dharma).⁷ The opinions of Hindu religious leaders, among others:

- a. Opinions Anand Krishna, defines karma phala is:
- Karma is action, every deed is an action, the action is a cause that will bring a result.
- Karma Phala is a result, and as a result only be the result of causes.
- Karma Phala is cause, where every cause brings effect.⁸
- b. In the opinion of Ed. Visvanathan, that karma phala is one of cause and effect.
- c. In the opinion of G. Pudja about karma phala and book Bhagawadgita (Pancama Veda), where he interprets karma phala is an action and when seen from the attitude of action activities.
- d. According Joesoef Sou'yb that karma phala is due to bear on every attitude and behavior and deeds in the worldly life.⁹

According to Hindu religion is mentioned in general that good works are called cubhakarma and criteria cubhakarma namely all forms of behavior that are justified by religion can lead humanity into a perfect life, happy birth inward and toward unity atman (Small sparks of

³Oka Punyatmadya, *Pancha Crada*, (Jakarta: Pustaka Mitra Jaya, 2003), 54.

⁴YM. Bhante Uttamo Mahathera. (n.d). *Hidup Sesuai Dhamma*. DhamaCitta Press, 3.

⁵Y. Khrishan. (1989). Collective Karmas. East and West, Vol. 39, No. 1/4 (December, 1989), 179-194.

⁶John. L.Esposito. World religions today. (New york: oxford university press. 2006), 281

⁷ Tim Penyusun Kamus Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, (Jakarta: Balai Pustaka), 1900, 447.

⁸Anand Krisna, Menyelami Misteri Kehidupan Bhagawadgita Bagi Orang Modern, (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1998), 153.

⁹Joesoef Sou'yb, Agama-Agama Besar di Dunia,(Jakarta: PT. al Husna Zakia, 1996), 53.

Brahman) and Brahman (God Almighty or Hyang Widhi)¹⁰. From some good behavior, there are some provisions as the mechanism rather than the implementation of the other three movements cubhakarma between human behavior which must be purified, that think that clean and pure, tell the truth and do what is right. So from a clean mind will arise a kind word and deed honest.

While the bad things called acubhakarma are all forms of deviant behavior and contrary to cubhakarma. This Acubhakarma unethical, which is the source of all, forms of action that is always contrary to morality or dharma (righteousness) and always tends to lead to crime. All types of actions are classified acubhakarma the restrictions that should be avoided in all forms of life because this acubhakarma actions cause human sin and alive to suffer.¹¹

The purpose of the law of karma phala that always follow a human, in which living beings can not escape from the cycle of karma phala is aiming to achieve perfection and happiness worldy and spiritually, cling on dharma (righteousness), fused acubhakarma (bad deeds) becomes cubhakarma (good actions), eliminate misery, leaving hell and then headed to heaven.

Highest goal is to achieve moksha, union of Atman with Brahman. Where man has achieved perfection of life in the form of inner purity guidelines and noble character of fellow human beings and creatures called jagadhita and give peace a spiritual source of happiness lasting. Sukha without walidhuka incomparable based on the fulfillment of lust, giving sanctity and causes the free spirit of the incarnation and feel united with God, which called Moksha¹².

Karma Phala is the third pillar of faith in Hindu religious belief contained in the teachings of the five CRADA. And guided by the teachings of the five CRADA Hindu religious scriptures like the book Sarasamuccaya, Bagawadgita, Veda. Where books are a source of Hindu religious law, laws or regulations that govern human behavior both as individuals and as a group in order to create a harmonious living atmosphere, efficient and orderly.¹³

Results of the action was not always can be felt and enjoyed. The hand that touches the ice will instantly cool, but grow rice have to wait for months to be able to reap the results. Every action will leave a mark, there is a real former, there are dreams and there are scars in the abstract. Therefore, the results of actions that could not be enjoy at the time of doing or the life now then he would receive after in the hereafter and sometimes be enjoyed on the life to come. Thus karma phala can be classified into three types according to the time and the opportunity to receive a result that is Sancita karma phala, prarabda karma karma phala and kriyamana phala.

1. Sancita Karma Phala

Is the result of our actions in a previous life that has not been exhausting enjoyed and still is the seed that determines our present lives. Those good deeds once we do but do not have the reward, eventually reborn for not achieving moksha to receive the reward and good works continuously until he reaches moksha.

2. Prarabda Karma Phala

Is the result of our actions in this life without rest again. That is good and bad deeds balanced and have been reward.

3. Kriyamana Karma Phala Is the result of acts that could not be enjoyed at the time of doing so must be received in the next life. That is deeds we have done but have not had time to reap the rewards or reward that will be receive in the next life.

¹⁰Arya, Usharbudh. (1972). *Hindu Contradictions of the Doctrine of Karma*. East and West, Vol. 22, No. 1/2 (March – June, 1972), 93-100.

¹¹Anak Agung Gde Oka Netra, Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu, (Jakarta : Hanoman. Sakti, 1997), 43.

¹²Anak Agung Gde Oka Netra, Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu, (Jakarta : Hanoman. Sakti, 1997), 58.

¹³G. Pudja, Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum), (Surabaya: Paramita, 1998), 25.

Thus the existence of suffering in this life even though someone is always doing good, it caused by karma (deeds) ago (Sancita karma). Especially bad, he must enjoy the results right now, because at birth the former has not run out of receipt Strictly speaking that sooner or later in life now or later. All the consequences of that action would be accepted, as it is already considered a lawful act.

Regarding the law of karma phalayang can be enjoyed in this life or the life in the hereafter, or even only be enjoyed in the life to come this has to do with reincarnation or punarbhawa (Rebirth).¹⁴ Thus, it can be concluded that karma phala will make man will not escape from what he had done that human actions through body, speech and mind. Therefore, doubt that someone will reap the rewards of what he sow, good or bad, and through the variety and complexity of the law of karma phala that make life had a difference mentally and physically, and with the law of karma phala it will lead to a rebirth. If the effects of human karma (karma phala) have not yet come to fruition in this world or the hereafter, the individual will undergo rebirth. This occurs due to the persistence of unfulfilled desires and intentions, causing the person to be reborn, even though the physical body or vessel differs from the previous one.

Karma in Buddhist Perspective

In pre-Buddhist literature, the term *karma* was primarily used to refer either to religious rituals or to the social roles and obligations of individuals. In the latter context, the *Īṣa Upaniṣad* states: "Let a man aspire to live a hundred years, performing his social duties" (kurvanneveḥa karmaṇi jijīviṣecchataṃ samāḥ).¹⁵ This meaning persists in Buddhist texts, where the term *karma* is often used in the plural to refer to the various professions and occupations of individuals. Thus, Buddhism recommends people to perform "morally blameless occupations" (anavajjāni kammāniī).

To those unacquainted with Buddhist teachings, the doctrine of karma might superficially resemble fatalism. Within the context of development discourse, this could be perceived as incompatible with social ethics that motivate individuals to actively seek ways to improve their circumstances. We do sometimes find an articulation of attitudes that can seem problematically fatalistic or deterministic. For instance, Tibetan Buddhism often takes a deterministic view of karma, suggesting that people are to blame in some sense for their current situation life because of their actions in a past life. This has caused controversy in recent times with regard to discussions about whether Buddhism would hold Jewish Holocaust victims responsible for their fate.¹⁶

Karma, in Buddhism, which means willful actions or the fruits of actions, is the everlasting law of cause and effect that is an essential ingredient in knowing the Ultimate Truth (Williams, 2008). Karma pertains to happiness in the following ways. Ultimate happiness obtained through Enlightenment. Positive Karma results in higher rebirth, bringing one closer to Nirvana. The Vipaka (result) ripening of Karma (deeds) leads to greater happiness, joy, and bliss when a person is reborn.

As a technical term, *karma* in early Buddhist texts specifically refers to volitional actions. These actions can be morally good (*kusala*), morally evil (*akusala*), or morally neutral (*anyākata*).

¹⁴G. Pudja, Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum), (Surabaya: Paramita, 1998), 31

¹⁵Y. Khrisnan. (1981). The Buddhist Doctrine of Karma and Development of Indian Religious Thought and Society. Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Vol. 62, No. 1/4 (1981), 103-120.

¹⁶Sivaraksa, Sulak and Ginsburg, Tom (eds), *Seeds of peace : a Buddhist vision for renewing society*. (Berkeley: Parallax Press. 1992).

They may be actions that find expression in bodily behavior (kāyakamma), verbal behavior (vacīkamma) and psychological behavior (mano-kamma).

The Morally good and evil actions are understood to lead to consequences, both individual and social, that may be either pleasant or unpleasant, depending on the nature of the action. These individual consequences may manifest in the current life, future lives, or subsequent rebirths, unless their potential is extinguished or they fail to find an opportunity to come to fruition.

It is often assumed that the foundation of the doctrine of karma in Buddhism rests on a rational argument, particularly one implied in the Cūlakammavibhaṅga Sutta. While it is true that this Sutta appears to present a rational basis for belief in karma, it would be erroneous to think that the doctrine is accepted as true or reflective of the true nature of things solely on these rational grounds. The operation of karmic laws is seen as part of a broader framework of causal laws in nature, which includes physical laws (utu-niyāma), biological laws (bīja-niyāma), psychological laws (citta-niyāma), karmic laws (kamma-niyāma) related to moral actions and their consequences, and laws governing spiritual phenomena (dhamma-niyāma). However, according to Buddhism, the patterns of events in nature are neither strictly deterministic nor entirely indeterministic.

Karmic laws, therefore, are more about tendencies than inevitable outcomes. Several of these tendencies are outlined in the Cūlakammavibhanga Sutta. The overarching principle suggests that morally good actions tend to result in pleasant consequences, while morally evil actions lead to unpleasant consequences for the individual in the end. Since good actions are inherently designed to promote both the material and spiritual well-being of humanity, this principle implies that one cannot achieve personal happiness at the expense of others.

Some specific correlations described in the Sutta include the following: Those who harm and injure living beings tend to experience ill health, while those who show compassion toward them tend to be healthy. Those who are prone to anger and irritability, who scowl at and abuse others, tend to appear unattractive, while those who are not tend to be beautiful. Those who feel envy and jealousy over the successes, honors, and respect of others tend to lose their own respect, whereas those who do not are likely to earn respect themselves.

During the medieval period, karma was classified in various ways. First, by function (kicca), karma was categorized as what gives birth (janaka), what supports a tendency (upatthambhaka), what obstructs a tendency (upapīļaka), and what destroys it (upaghātaka). Second, according to how karma comes into fruition (pāka-dāna-pariyāya), karma was divided into weighty (garuka), proximate (āsanna), habitual (āciṇṇa), and residual (kaṭattā). Third, based on the timing of its effect (pāka-kāla), karma was categorized into four types: karma that is experienced in this life (diṭṭhadhamma-vedanīya), in the next life (upapajja-vedanīya), in some future life (aparāpara-vedanīya), or never at all (ahosi). Finally, according to the locus in which the effects occur, karma was distinguished by the realm in which it produces results: evil karma is said to find fruition in the worlds of sense-gratification, while good karma can have effects in both the sensory and subtle material realms (rūpa-loka) and even in the immaterial, ideational realms (arūpa-loka).

Buddhists believe that suffering also occurs through the selfish and mindless craving of sensual pleasure and material wealth and power by individual egos, which may cause evil deeds (Armstrong, 2004; Batchelor, 2010; Keown. 2013; Leighton, 2012; Mitchell, 2008; Smith & Novak, 2003).¹⁷ Buddhists have further identified additional reasons suffering continues, including past conditioning to expect suffering and ignorance of the ultimate reality of existence or the Ultimate Truth. The Ultimate Truth, which has also been refer to as Nirvana (which means

¹⁷in Givel, M. Mahayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan. International Journal of Wellbeing, 5(2), 2015, 14-27.

"to extinguish desire"), Enlightenment, or the Awakening, is a state of transcendent metaphysical reality, and the attainment of this state of happiness is the ultimate goal of Buddhism (French, 2002).¹⁸

The immediate goal for a Buddhist should be to attain the first stage of spiritual development, known as sotāpanna, through the eradication of attachment to the ego and egocentered views (sakkāya-ditthi). This involves eliminating doubts regarding the Buddhist understanding of the nature and destiny of humanity in the universe (vicikicchā) by engaging in thoughtful examination, inquiry, and partial verification of the truths of the Dhamma. It also requires recognizing that religion is an integral part of one's daily life and experience, rather than an obsessive attachment to rituals and rites (sīlabbataparāmāsa).

A person who reaches this stage is considered "not liable to fall below the status of human existence" (avinipātadhammo) and is destined to achieve the ultimate goal of enlightenment (niyato sambodhiparāyano) in due time. This path leads to the dissolution of karmic bondage (kammakkhaya), where the good life is cultivated through the development of selflessness, love, and understanding for their own intrinsic value, not for the pursuit of egoistic rewards..¹⁹

Discussion

Through the process of observation, analysis, and long experimentation, Buddha finally managed to penetrate the truth (Dhamma) and formulate a way of life (way of life), Eight Main paths. As a way of life, his teachings are open to anyone regardless of gender, skin color, social status, or other factors. In addition, about heaven and hell in the Hindu, that heaven and hell that could happen in the world and can occur in the hereafter²⁰. Doom-doom as retribution for bad deeds he did in this world and heaven and hell can also occur, which if our life in this world suffer from it is called hell and vice versa if we live in this world happy it is called paradise.

The above description indicates that in fact the teachings of good karma in Hinduism and Buddhism are the same. Karma taught is about acts committed by humans going back to him again. If translated then, if men do good things in his life that he will receive good things. However, if men in his life never doing well or just do bad things just so he would receive bad treatment in accordance with what it does to others.

Nevertheless, in the life of the world it is impossible for a human being just doing things right or vice versa is only doing bad things alone. In an ancient Chinese philosophy of life, there is the term "Yin & Yang" which is a circle divided into two with two different colors, each black and white with a black spot on the white part and the white dot in the black. This term has a meaning, "As bad nature of man he must have good in him, otherwise best man he must also have the badness in him." Strictly speaking, it can be say that no one living in this world is perfect existence, because perfection belongs only to the Creator.

Association with karma, man must never do well and never do evil. In human life will receive the reward of doing good deeds and will receive recompense for the bad treatment. This happened to anyone, not just those who are Hindu or Buddhist. If viewed from the teachings, Buddhism, karma is one of the eight main roads to reach heaven or nirvana. In Buddhism, karma is more emphasis on the life of a human being order to better appreciate. The life given to him

¹⁸ in Givel, M. Mahayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan. International Journal of Wellbeing, 5(2), 2015, 14-27.

¹⁹Various, Bikkhu Dhammapala, V.F. Guratna., P.M Rao, T.B. Karuneatne, Francis Story, K.N Jayatileke, Bikkhu Nanajivako, Bikkhu Khantipalo & Lal Mani Joshi.. *Collected Wheel Publications,* Buddhist Publication Society *Vol. X.* 2011, 132-151

²⁰Y. Khrishan. Collective karmas

by force in accordance with the norms and customs that exist in the vicinity as well as the focus of his heart to the Creator, that man will be spared of the temptations that can plunge into sin.

While in Hinduism, karma clearly explained as something to be avoid. The doctrine of karma, explained about how human life if he die, what will he receive, and how his life in the next life all determined by his actions in life today. In this teaching, karma has emphasized that the highest goal moksha, which man has reached the perfection of his life, which is not based anymore by worldly desires. When a man does not reach the perfection of his life, then people will be allow to make amends in the next life by bringing karma from previous lives.

The teachings of the two religions difference lies only in the way to explain how a human being can gain karma and how your man can avoid karma and gain the fullness of life. In spite of that, the notion of karma in general and understanding of Karma according to Buddhism and Hinduism are not much different. Karma is a doctrine about human actions, if a man does good deeds, then he will receive a kindness. However, if a man does not do good deeds, then in her life or in the next life he would receive a reply from what they do and had to fix it in the next life to escape from worldly desires and achieve the perfection of life.

Conclussion

Karma is a doctrine about human actions, if a man does good deeds, then he will receive a kindness. Nevertheless, if a man does not do good deeds, then in her life or in the next life he would receive a reply from what it does and must fix it in the next life to escape from worldly desires and achieve the perfection of life. In the Buddhism teachings not explain how a man will attain the perfection of life as in the Hindu religion, but an explanation about karma teachings of both are the same. Stay depends on us as human beings to respond to the teachings of Hinduism and Buddhism is to be applying in our lives. We never know what will happen next in our lives, but realizing that karma applies to anyone, well if we are more introspective again.

References

Esposito. John L. World Religions Today. New York: Oxford University Press. 2006.

- Dhammapala, Bikkhu, V.F. Guratna., P.M Rao, T.B. Karuneatne, Francis Story, K.N Jayatileke, Bikkhu Nanajivako, Bikkhu Khantipalo & Lal Mani Joshi. *Buddhist Publication Society*. Collected Wheel Publications, Vol. X, Numbers. 2011.
- Khrishan. Y. Collective Karmas. East and West, Vol. 39, No. 1/4, December, 1989.
- Khrishan. Y. The Buddhist Doctrine of Karma and Development of Indian Religious Thought and Society. Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Vol. 62,No. ¹/₄, 1981.
- Krisna, Anand, Menyelami Misteri Kehidupan Bhagawadgita Bagi Orang Modern, Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1998.
- Mahathera. YM. Bhante Uttamo. Hidup Sesuai Dhamma. DhamaCitta Press.
- M. Givel, Mahayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan. International Journal of Wellbeing, Vol. 5, No.2.
- Netra. Anak Agung Gde Oka. Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu, Jakarta: Hanoman. Sakti, 1997.
- Pudja. G. Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum), Surabaya: Paramita, 1998
- Punyatmadya. Oka. Pancha Crada, Jakarta: Pustaka Mitra Jaya, 2003.
- Reichenbach. Bruce R. The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4, Oct, 1988.
- Sou'yb .Joesoef. Agama-Agama Besar di Dunia, Jakarta: PT. al Husna Zakia, 1996
- Sulak. Sivaraksa and Ginsburg. Seeds of peace: a Buddhist vision for Renewing Society. Berkeley: Parallax Press.

- Tim Penyusun. Kamus Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 1900.
- Usharbudh Arya. *Hindu Contradictions of the Doctrine of Karma*. East and West, Vol. 22, No. ¹/₂, March June, 1972.