

Karma In The Hinduism And Buddhism Perspective

Husnul Khotimah, Muhammad Sandi Rosyadi

UIN Antasari Banjarmasin
husnulKhotimah@uin-antasari.ac.id, muhammadsandirosyadi@uin-antasari.ac.id

Diterima 10 Juni 2023 | Direview 20 Juni 2023 | Diterbitkan 30 Juni 2023

Abstrak

Tulisan ini akan menjelaskan tentang ideologi yang sering disebut "Karma". Penggunaan kata "Karma" secara umum dimaksudkan untuk menggambarkan hal-hal yang tidak baik; karma selalu dikaitkan dengan karma buruk. Faktanya, karma tidak hanya buruk tetapi juga karma baik. Selain sebagai karma buruk, konsep karma juga sering diidentifikasi sebagai satu-satunya penyebab kejadian tersebut. Kata "Karma" populer dalam ajaran agama Hindu dan Buddha. Namun, masih banyak kesalahpahaman tentang kata "Karma" itu sendiri yang didefinisikan oleh orang-orang. Seperti Karma dalam Buddhisme adalah doktrin hukuman yang didapat dari perbuatan buruk, ada pula yang mengubungkan buruknya kesehatan manusia sebagai Karma, dan banyak kesalahpahaman tentang karma. Pengertian Karma dilihat dalam perspektif agama Hindu dan Buddha, sekaligus mencari tahu ada tidaknya kesamaan pengertian, ajaran, pelaksanaan Karma dalam agama Hindu dan Buddha.

Kata Kunci: Agama Buddha; Agama Hindu; Doktrin Karma

Abstract

This paper will explain about ideology that often called "Karma". The use of the word "Karma" generally intended to illustrate things that are not good; karma is always associated with bad karma. In fact, karma is not only bad but also good karma. Aside from being a bad karma, karma concept also often identified as the sole cause of the incident. The word "Karma" is popular in the teachings of Hinduism and Buddhism. However, there is still a lot of misunderstanding about the word "Karma" itself defined by people. As with Karma in Buddhism is a doctrine of punishment will be in getting from bad deeds, some are linking the poor health of a human being as Karma, and many misconceptions about karma. Understanding Karma seen in the perspective of Hinduism and Buddhism, while also finding out whether or not the similarity of understanding, teaching, the implementation of the Karma in Hinduism and Buddhism.

Keywords: Buddhist Religion, Doctrine Karma; Hinduism Religion

Introduction

In the world there are five major religious sects embraced by many people in every country. Islam, Christian, Catholic, Hindu and Buddhism are the religion fifth scattered all over the world. The five religions have teachings about the same, which automatically also regulates the way of life of its adherents. Infrequently, these teachings also taught in other religions, it is just the way of delivery are slightly different but the value delivered is the same. One example of these teachings is Karma, a lot of people known that karma taught by Hinduism and Buddhism but not many know what Karma sense for the two religions. How did the people of these two religion beliefs about karma? How is the understanding of both religions about karma? In addition, is there a similarity of the doctrine of Karma between the two religions?

As a layperson we have heard the phrase, "Every action must be a cause and effect" is a phrase that is often referred to as "Karma" in the life of our society¹. In general, we understand that every action we did particularly bad deeds will be punish. Meanwhile, for every good work we will definitely get something good as our expectations at the right time. This belief is not only trusted by the people of Hinduism or Buddhism alone but almost the whole of mankind on earth who embrace any religion other than Hinduism and Buddhism. We understand the above belief is not entirely true, because by looking at the trends, people see karma as punishment of any bad acts. In addition, People tend to speak of or criticize the doctrine of karma as though there was only one such doctrine common to different religions such as Hinduism, Jainism and Ājīvikism

¹Bruce R. Reichenbach. (1988). *The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation*. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4 (Oct, 1988), 399-410.

despite the fact that they profess different teachings about the nature, operations and attitude to the alleged phenomenon of karma.

Another misconception which is partly connected with the above misunderstanding is that the doctrine of karma constitutes or implies a fatalist attitude to life and nature, a view put forward by some (not all) Western scholars and even subscribed to by some South Asian intellectuals both non-Buddhist/Hinduism and even Buddhist/Hinduism².

Yet another source of misunderstanding is the attempt on the part of certain scholars and other individuals to rationalize (quite unnecessarily) the doctrine of karma by interpreting it to mean the social or biological inheritance of man or both, ignoring altogether and distorting the authentic teachings.

Therefore, this paper will discuss the definition and Hindu and Buddhist religious teachings about karma and see whether or not there are similarities between the two religions. The journal divided into several parts; the first part of this paper will briefly describe the background that encourages the writing journal and the purpose of journal writing. The second part will discuss the notion of karma in general, and will be narrow in understanding and teachings of karma in Hinduism and Buddhism separately. The third section discusses whether is there any similarity between the doctrine of karma taught in Hinduism and Buddhism? Lastly, to conclude discussion conducted with reference to the discussion of literature on the two.

Methods

This paper uses a quantitative method with a literature study approach. The literature study research method is a research method that examines and analyzes existing and documented data from various sources, such as books, journals, scientific articles, and others. Literature study research aims to know and understand a problem comprehensively under study.

In research on the karma, the literature study research method can be used to gather information about history, culture, and beliefs. Apart from that, literature study research can also be used to find out how the paradigm of earlier scholars and the thoughts that formed a religious paradigm can be formed so that it influences views on karma beliefs. To collect data, the author can search for and read various literary sources that are relevant to the problems studied. After the data is collected, the author can then perform data analysis using various techniques, such as thematic or qualitative analysis.

Literature Review

The law of karma functions as a central motif in Hindu, Jains, and Buddhist thought. Simply formulated, it states that all actions have consequences that will affect the doer of the action at some future time. So stated, it might seem that the law of karma is nothing other than the law of universal causation, according to which every action, event, or contingent being is caused. Clearly, the two laws related, though the precise nature of their relation frequently left not clarified. The law of karma variously described by different authors as identical with, parallel to, or an application of the law of universal causation.

Karma is derived from the word "kr" which is taken from the Sanskrit word which means to move or do.³ That is any motion or activity undertaken, be it intentional or unintentional act.

²Bruce R. Reichenbach. (1988). *The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation*. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4 (Oct, 1988), 399-410.

³Oka Punyatmadya, *Pancha Crada*, (Jakarta: Pustaka Mitra Jaya, 2003), 54.

The act is good or bad, right or wrong. Karma is the intention to do something. Actions undertaken by the mind are called karma through the mind⁴; acts committed by the so-called karma through speech utterance; and actions undertaken by the agency called karma through the body. Accordingly, karma could be divided into good karma and bad karma.

Karma are to be defined in terms of (a) the authors or persons who perform the karmas and (b) the retribution of karmas when it affects simultaneously a large number of persons. Negatively speaking collective karmas are those karmas, which are done, not experienced not by an individual exclusively. Positively speaking collective karmas can be classified into two categories:

- (i) 'Group causation' karmas? Caste, class or community acting together jointly;
- (ii) Actions giving rise to 'group retribution', is that consequences of actions resulting from transpersonal factors? Regional, national or transnational. In this class, we may also include natural calamities and accidents causing mass or large-scale suffering and destruction. Such retribution, in accordance with the doctrine of karma, deemed to have its genesis in past evil deeds of the victims.⁵

Karma in Hinduism Perspective

In Hindu, an individual destiny is samsara is determined by actions (deeds and thoughts) the person performs. Good deeds eventually bear good consequence, while bad deeds ripen into evil consequences. This natural law, which operates throughout samsara and effects the destiny of the atman is called karma⁶. Karma Phala is causal, therefore all causes would surely bring a result. Likewise, because of a movement or action would lead to a result. Karma also is an act of man while living in the world (to live as God's people, it just did Dharma).⁷ The opinions of Hindu religious leaders, among others:

- a. Opinions Anand Krishna, defines karma phala is:
 - o Karma is action, every deed is an action, the action is a cause that will bring a result.
 - o Karma Phala is a result, and as a result only be the result of causes.
 - o Karma Phala is cause, where every cause brings effect.⁸
- b. In the opinion of Ed. Visvanathan, that karma phala is one of cause and effect.
- c. In the opinion of G. Pudja about karma phala and book Bhagawadgita (Pancama Veda), where he interprets karma phala is an action and when seen from the attitude of action activities.
- d. According Joesoef Sou'yb that karma phala is due to bear on every attitude and behavior and deeds in the worldly life.⁹

According to Hindu religion is mentioned in general that good works are called cubhakarma and criteria cubhakarma namely all forms of behavior that are justified by religion can lead humanity into a perfect life, happy birth inward and toward unity atman (Small sparks of Brahman) and Brahman (God Almighty or Hyang Widhi)¹⁰. From some good behavior, there are some provisions as the mechanism rather than the implementation of the other three movements

⁴YM. Bhante Uttamo Mahathera. (n.d). *Hidup Sesuai Dhamma*. DhamaCitta Press, 3.

⁵Y. Khrishan. (1989). *Collective Karmas*. East and West, Vol. 39, No. 1/4 (December, 1989), 179-194.

⁶John. L.Esposito. *World religions today*. (New york: oxford university press. 2006), 281

⁷Tim Penyusun Kamus Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, (Jakarta: Balai Pustaka), 1900, 447.

⁸Anand Krisna, *Menyelami Misteri Kehidupan Bhagawadgita Bagi Orang Modern*, (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1998), 153.

⁹Joesoef Sou'yb, *Agama-Agama Besar di Dunia*, (Jakarta: PT. al Husna Zakia, 1996), 53.

¹⁰Arya, Usharbudh. (1972). *Hindu Contradictions of the Doctrine of Karma*. East and West, Vol. 22, No. 1/2 (March – June, 1972), 93-100.

cubhakarma between human behavior which must be purified, that think that clean and pure, tell the truth and do what is right. So from a clean mind will arise a kind word and deed honest.

While the bad things called acubhakarma are all forms of deviant behavior and contrary to cubhakarma. This Acubhakarma unethical, which is the source of all, forms of action that is always contrary to morality or dharma (righteousness) and always tends to lead to crime. All types of actions are classified acubhakarma the restrictions that should be avoided in all forms of life because this acubhakarma actions cause human sin and alive to suffer.¹¹

The purpose of the law of karma phala that always follow a human, in which living beings can not escape from the cycle of karma phala is aiming to achieve perfection and happiness worldly and spiritually, cling on dharma (righteousness), fused acubhakarma (bad deeds) becomes cubhakarma (good actions), eliminate misery, leaving hell and then headed to heaven.

Highest goal is to achieve moksha, union of Atman with Brahman. Where man has achieved perfection of life in the form of inner purity guidelines and noble character of fellow human beings and creatures called jagadhita and give peace a spiritual source of happiness lasting. Sukha without walidhuka incomparable based on the fulfillment of lust, giving sanctity and causes the free spirit of the incarnation and feel united with God, which called Moksha¹².

Karma Phala is the third pillar of faith in Hindu religious belief contained in the teachings of the five CRADA. And guided by the teachings of the five CRADA Hindu religious scriptures like the book Sarasamuccaya, Bagawadgita, Veda. Where books are a source of Hindu religious law, laws or regulations that govern human behavior both as individuals and as a group in order to create a harmonious living atmosphere, efficient and orderly.¹³

Results of the action was not always can be felt and enjoyed. The hand that touches the ice will instantly cool, but grow rice have to wait for months to be able to reap the results. Every action will leave a mark, there is a real former, there are dreams and there are scars in the abstract. Therefore, the results of actions that could not be enjoy at the time of doing or the life now then he would receive after in the hereafter and sometimes be enjoyed on the life to come. Thus karma phala can be classified into three types according to the time and the opportunity to receive a result that is Sancita karma phala, prarabda karma karma phala and kriyamana phala.

1. Sancita Karma Phala

Is the result of our actions in a previous life that has not been exhausting enjoyed and still is the seed that determines our present lives. Those good deeds once we do but do not have the reward, eventually reborn for not achieving moksha to receive the reward and good works continuously until he reaches moksha.

2. Prarabda Karma Phala

Is the result of our actions in this life without rest again. That is good and bad deeds balanced and have been reward.

3. Kriyamana Karma Phala

Is the result of acts that could not be enjoyed at the time of doing so must be received in the next life. That is deeds we have done but have not had time to reap the rewards or reward that will be receive in the next life.

Thus the existence of suffering in this life even though someone is always doing good, it caused by karma (deeds) ago (Sancita karma). Especially bad, he must enjoy the results right now, because at birth the former has not run out of receipt Strictly speaking that sooner or later in life

¹¹Anak Agung Gde Oka Netra, *Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu*, (Jakarta : Hanoman. Sakti, 1997), 43.

¹²Anak Agung Gde Oka Netra, *Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu*, (Jakarta : Hanoman. Sakti, 1997), 58.

¹³G. Pudja, *Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum)*, (Surabaya: Paramita, 1998), 25.

now or later. All the results of that action would have been welcome because it is already a legal act.

Regarding the law of karma phalayang can be enjoyed in this life or the life in the hereafter, or even only be enjoyed in the life to come this has to do with reincarnation or punarbhawa (Rebirth).¹⁴ Thus, it can be concluded that karma phala will make man will not escape from what he had done that human actions through body, speech and mind. Therefore, doubt that someone will reap the rewards of what he sow, good or bad, and through the variety and complexity of the law of karma phala that make life had a difference mentally and physically, and with the law of karma phala it will lead to a rebirth. Where human karma phala that have not been happening in this world or in the hereafter, then the human being will be born again and because of the persistence of the desires or wishes that have not done so as a human being born again even though the body or the body of the container is different from the first.

Karma in Buddhist Perspective

In the pre-Buddhist literature, the word of karma was use mainly in the sense of either religious rituals or the social functions and duties of man. In the latter sense the Īṣa Upaniṣad says: “Let a man aspire to live a hundred years, performing his social duties” (*kurvanneveḥa karmaṇi jijīviṣecchataṃ samāḥ*).¹⁵ This sense has survived in the Buddhist texts, where the word karma is used in the plural to denote the different professions or occupations of men. Thus, Buddhism recommends people to perform “morally blameless occupations” (*anavajjāni kammāni*).

To those unfamiliar with Buddhist teaching, the doctrine of karma may appear to be similar to fatalism, which within the context of thinking about development could seem to be non-conducive to social ethics that encourage people to consider ways that they can improve their situation. We do sometimes find an articulation of attitudes that can seem problematically fatalistic or deterministic. For instance, Tibetan Buddhism often takes a deterministic view of karma, suggesting that people are to blame in some sense for their current situation life because of their actions in a past life. This has caused controversy in recent times with regard to discussions about whether Buddhism would hold Jewish Holocaust victims responsible for their fate.¹⁶

Karma, in Buddhism, which means willful actions or the fruits of actions, is the everlasting law of cause and effect that is an essential ingredient in knowing the Ultimate Truth (Williams, 2008). Karma pertains to happiness in the following ways. Ultimate happiness obtained through Enlightenment. Positive Karma results in higher rebirth, bringing one closer to Nirvana. The Vipaka (result) ripening of Karma (deeds) leads to greater happiness, joy, and bliss when a person is reborn.

As a technical term, the word karma used in the early Buddhist texts to denote volitional actions. These actions may be morally good (*kusala*), morally evil (*akusala*) or morally neutral (*avyākata*). They may be actions that find expression in bodily behavior (*kāyakamma*), verbal behavior (*vacī-kamma*) and psychological behavior (*mano-kamma*).

¹⁴G. Pudja, *Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum)*, (Surabaya: Paramita, 1998), 31

¹⁵Y. Khrisnan. (1981). *The Buddhist Doctrine of Karma and Development of Indian Religious Thought and Society*. Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Vol. 62, No. 1/4 (1981), 103-120.

¹⁶Sivaraksa, Sulak and Ginsburg, Tom (eds), *Seeds of peace : a Buddhist vision for renewing society*. (Berkeley: Parallax Press. 1992).

The morally good and evil actions are said to be liable to give rise to consequences, individual as well as social, pleasant and unpleasant overall as the case may be. The individual consequences may be manifested in this life, the next life or the lives to come unless their potentialities get extinguished or they do not find an opportunity for fruition.

It is often assume that the basis for the doctrine of karma in Buddhism is a rational argument implicit in the *Cūḷakammavibhaṅga Sutta*. It is true that in this *Sutta* the Buddha seems to suggest purely rational grounds for believing in the doctrine of karma, but it would be mistaken to believe that the doctrine is accepted as true or as representing the nature of things as they are on these grounds. The operation of these laws of karma was only a special instance of the operation of causal laws in nature, in which there were physical laws (*utu-niyāma*), biological laws (*bīja-niyāma*), psychological laws (*citta-niyāma*), karmic laws (*kamma-niyāma*) pertaining to moral acts and their consequences and laws pertaining to spiritual phenomena (*dhamma-niyāma*). But the patterns of events in nature, according to Buddhism, are neither deterministic nor in deterministic.

Karmic laws, therefore, state tendencies rather than inevitable consequences. Several of these correlations stated in the *Cūḷakammavibhaṅga Sutta*. The general principle is that morally good acts tend to be follow by pleasant consequences and morally evil acts by unpleasant consequences in the end to the individual. Since it is of the nature of good acts to promote the material and spiritual well being of mankind, it follows from this general principle that one cannot gain one's own happiness at the expense of others.

Among the specific correlations are the following: Those who harm and hurt living beings tend to be sickly, while those who are compassionate towards them tend to be healthy. Those who are angry and irritable scowl at and abuse people tend to be ugly, while the others who are not so, tend to be beautiful. Those who are envious and jealous of the gain, honors and respect bestowed on others tend to lose respect while the others would tend to command respect.

In the medieval period, we find karma classified, firstly according to function (*kicca*) as what gives birth (*janaka*), what tends to support a tendency (*upatthambhaka*), what tends to obstruct a tendency (*upapīlaka*) and what destroys (*upaghātaka*). Secondly, according to the manner in which they come into fruition (*pāka-dāna-pariyāya*), they classified as weighty (*garuka*), proximate (*āsanna*), habitual (*āciṇṇa*) and residual (*kaṭattā*). Thirdly, according to the time of taking effect (*pāka-kāla*) there are four sorts—what is “experience” in this life (*diṭṭhadhamma-vedanīya*), in the next life (*upapajja-vedanīya*), sometime in the future (*aparāpara-vedanīya*) or never (*ahosi*). Fourthly, according to the locus in which the effects take place there is evil karma finding fruition in the worlds of sense-gratification; similarly it is with good karma; and there is also good karma which becomes effective in the subtle material worlds (*rūpa-loka*) and the immaterial, ideational worlds (*arūpa-loka*).

Buddhists believe that suffering also occurs through the selfish and mindless craving of sensual pleasure and material wealth and power by individual egos, which may cause evil deeds (Armstrong, 2004; Batchelor, 2010; Keown, 2013; Leighton, 2012; Mitchell, 2008; Smith & Novak, 2003).¹⁷ Buddhists have further identified additional reasons suffering continues, including past conditioning to expect suffering and ignorance of the ultimate reality of existence or the Ultimate Truth. The Ultimate Truth, which has also been refer to as Nirvana (which means “to extinguish desire”), Enlightenment, or the Awakening, is a state of transcendent metaphysical

¹⁷in Givel, M. *Mahayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan*. International Journal of Wellbeing, 5(2), 2015, 14-27.

reality, and the attainment of this state of happiness is the ultimate goal of Buddhism (French, 2002).¹⁸

The immediate ideal of the Buddhist should therefore be that of attaining. The first stage of spiritual development (sotāpanna) by the elimination of attachment to notions of ego and ego-centered views (sakkāya-diṭṭhi). By elimination of doubts regarding the Buddhist account of the nature and destiny of man in the universe (vicikicchā) through examination, inquiry into and partial verification of the truth of the Dhamma, and the realization that religion is part and parcel of one's daily living and experience and not of obsessional attachment to rites and rituals (sīlabbataparāmāsa). Such a person is "not liable to fall below the status of human existence"¹⁹(avinipātadhammo) and is destined to achieve the goal of enlightenment (niyato sambodhiparāyano) before long. This is the path leading to the destruction of karmic bondage (kammakkhaya) that the good life is cultivated with the growth of selflessness, love and understanding for its own intrinsic worth and not for egoistic rewards.¹⁹

Discussion

Through the process of observation, analysis, and long experimentation, Buddha finally managed to penetrate the truth (Dhamma) and formulate a way of life (way of life), Eight Main paths. As a way of life, his teachings are open to anyone regardless of gender, skin color, social status, or other factors. In addition, about heaven and hell in the Hindu, that heaven and hell that could happen in the world and can occur in the hereafter²⁰. Doom-doom as retribution for bad deeds he did in this world and heaven and hell can also occur, which if our life in this world suffer from it is called hell and vice versa if we live in this world happy it is called paradise.

The above description indicates that in fact the teachings of good karma in Hinduism and Buddhism are the same. Karma taught is about acts committed by humans going back to him again. If translated then, if men do good things in his life that he will receive good things. However, if men in his life never doing well or just do bad things just so he would receive bad treatment in accordance with what it does to others.

Nevertheless, in the life of the world it is impossible for a human being just doing things right or vice versa is only doing bad things alone. In an ancient Chinese philosophy of life, there is the term "Yin & Yang" which is a circle divided into two with two different colors, each black and white with a black spot on the white part and the white dot in the black. This term has a meaning, "As bad nature of man he must have good in him, otherwise best man he must also have the badness in him." Strictly speaking, it can be say that no one living in this world is perfect existence, because perfection belongs only to the Creator.

Association with karma, man must never do well and never do evil. In human life will receive the reward of doing good deeds and will receive recompense for the bad treatment. This happened to anyone, not just those who are Hindu or Buddhist. If viewed from the teachings, Buddhism, karma is one of the eight main roads to reach heaven or nirvana. In Buddhism, karma is more emphasis on the life of a human being order to better appreciate. The life given to him by force in accordance with the norms and customs that exist in the vicinity as well as the focus of his heart to the Creator, that man will be spared of the temptations that can plunge into sin.

¹⁸ in Givel, M. *Mabayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan*. International Journal of Wellbeing, 5(2), 2015, 14-27.

¹⁹Various, Bikkhu Dhammapala, V.F. Guratna., P.M Rao, T.B. Karuneatne, Francis Story, K.N Jayatileke, Bikkhu Nanajivako, Bikkhu Khantipalo & Lal Mani Joshi.. *Collected Wheel Publications*, Buddhist Publication Society Vol. X, 2011, 132-151

²⁰Y. Khrishan. *Collective karmas*

While in Hinduism, karma clearly explained as something to be avoid. The doctrine of karma, explained about how human life if he die, what will he receive, and how his life in the next life all determined by his actions in life today. In this teaching, karma has emphasized that the highest goal moksha, which man has reached the perfection of his life, which is not based anymore by worldly desires. When a man does not reach the perfection of his life, then people will be allow to make amends in the next life by bringing karma from previous lives.

The teachings of the two religions difference lies only in the way to explain how a human being can gain karma and how your man can avoid karma and gain the fullness of life. In spite of that, the notion of karma in general and understanding of Karma according to Buddhism and Hinduism are not much different. Karma is a doctrine about human actions, if a man does good deeds, then he will receive a kindness. However, if a man does not do good deeds, then in her life or in the next life he would receive a reply from what they do and had to fix it in the next life to escape from worldly desires and achieve the perfection of life.

Conclusion

Karma is a doctrine about human actions, if a man does good deeds, then he will receive a kindness. Nevertheless, if a man does not do good deeds, then in her life or in the next life he would receive a reply from what it does and must fix it in the next life to escape from worldly desires and achieve the perfection of life. In the Buddhism teachings not explain how a man will attain the perfection of life as in the Hindu religion, but an explanation about karma teachings of both are the same. Stay depends on us as human beings to respond to the teachings of Hinduism and Buddhism is to be applying in our lives. We never know what will happen next in our lives, but realizing that karma applies to anyone, well if we are more introspective again.

References

- Esposito. John L. *World Religions Today*. New York: Oxford University Press. 2006.
- Dhammapala, Bikkhu, V.F. Guratna., P.M Rao, T.B. Karuneatne, Francis Story, K.N Jayatileke, Bikkhu Nanajivako, Bikkhu Khantipalo & Lal Mani Joshi. *Buddhist Publication Society*. Collected Wheel Publications, Vol. X, Numbers. 2011.
- Khrishan. Y. *Collective Karmas*. East and West, Vol. 39, No. ¼, December, 1989.
- Khrishan. Y. *The Buddhist Doctrine of Karma and Development of Indian Religious Thought and Society*. Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Vol. 62, No. ¼, 1981.
- Krisna, Anand, *Menyelami Misteri Kehidupan Bhagawadgita Bagi Orang Modern*, Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1998.
- Mahathera. YM. Bhante Uttamo. *Hidup Sesuai Dhamma*. DhamaCitta Press.
- M. Givel, *Mahayana Buddhism and Gross National Happiness in Bhutan*. International Journal of Wellbeing, Vol. 5, No.2.
- Netra. *Anak Agung Gde Oka*. Tuntunan Dasar Agama Hindu, Jakarta: Hanoman. Sakti, 1997.
- Pudja. G. *Pengantar Agama Hindu III Veda (Satu Studi Mengenai Kedudukan Veda Sebagai Sumber Hukum)*, Surabaya: Paramita, 1998
- Punyatmadya. Oka. *Pancha Crada*, Jakarta: Pustaka Mitra Jaya, 2003.
- Reichenbach. Bruce R. *The Law of Karma and the Principle of Causation*. Philosophy East and West, Vol. 38, No. 4, Oct, 1988.
- Sou'yb Joesoef. *Agama-Agama Besar di Dunia*, Jakarta: PT. al Husna Zakia, 1996
- Sulak. Sivaraksa and Ginsburg. *Seeds of peace: a Buddhist vision for Renewing Society*. Berkeley: Parallax Press.

Tim Penyusun. *Kamus Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan*, Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 1900.

Usharbudh Arya. *Hindu Contradictions of the Doctrine of Karma*. East and West, Vol. 22, No. ½, March – June, 1972.