

Marketing Strategy Through the Integration of Red Ocean and Blue Ocean Approaches in the Online Service Industry of PT. Gojek Indonesia: A Review

Aswan Nazairin¹, Noor Ainah², Halimah³

¹²³ Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis Islam, Institut Agama Islam Darussalam Martapura

*Corresponding author email

Abstract

The online services industry in Indonesia has experienced rapid growth, accompanied by increasingly intense competition. PT. Gojek Indonesia, as one of the pioneers in this industry, faces the challenge of continuously innovating and maintaining its market position. In this context, it is crucial to explore effective marketing strategies to achieve competitive advantage and expand market share. This research examines marketing strategies through the integration of Red Ocean and Blue Ocean approaches within PT. Gojek Indonesia's online services sector. The aim of this study is to analyze the effectiveness of combining competitive (Red Ocean) and innovative (Blue Ocean) strategies in enhancing Gojek's competitiveness and expanding its market share amid the intensifying competition in the online services industry. The research method employed is a literature review, involving the collection and analysis of secondary data from various reputable sources, including scientific journals, industry reports, and company publications. Through this analysis, the study seeks to identify best practices and innovations that Gojek has implemented in developing effective marketing strategies. The findings indicate that the integration of Red Ocean and Blue Ocean strategies provides significant competitive advantages for Gojek. The Red Ocean strategy enables Gojek to withstand intense competition by leveraging internal strengths and operational efficiency. Meanwhile, the Blue Ocean approach allows Gojek to create new value through service innovation and product diversification, which in turn broadens its customer base and enhances customer loyalty. The study concludes that the combination of Red Ocean and Blue Ocean strategies can serve as an effective model for other companies in the online services industry seeking to remain competitive and innovative in a dynamic market. The practical implications of this research include strategic recommendations for Gojek's management and the online services industry at large, advocating for the adoption of a holistic and sustainable marketing approach.

Keywords : *Marketing strategy, Red Ocean, Blue Ocean, PT. Gojek Indonesia*

INTRODUCTION

Marketing is a crucial instrument in business (Mubarak, Faridah, Yuliani, Sukarni, & Fong, 2023), as it is the foundation of transactions. Marketing strategy plays a significant role in shaping public perception and evaluation of a product (Malihah & Nazairin, 2024). A marketing strategy is a marketing action plan designed to achieve business objectives. It includes specific strategies for target markets, market positioning, marketing mix, and marketing budget allocation (Kotler & Keller, 2010). Broadly speaking, marketing strategy encompasses all the steps a company takes to identify a target market (Wajdi, et al., 2023), and meet customer needs through a combination of product, distribution, promotion, and pricing (Pratama, 2016). In an increasingly competitive business environment, the rapid pace of market domination is a challenge that businesses must face. The use of effective and efficient marketing strategies is key to addressing this issue (Malihah, 2023).

Globalization has permeated various aspects of society, including the economic sphere. Advances in technology and the rapid flow of information have made it easier for individuals to conduct business. Producers have employed a variety of methods and strategies to introduce and market their products in this increasingly open market (Malihah & Meilania, 2023). In the ever-evolving digital era, the online service industry has become a highly competitive sector. Amidst this intense competition, many Indonesian companies are continuously striving to develop innovative marketing strategies to maintain and increase their market share. Serious and persistent efforts must be undertaken by companies to ensure that their products can compete with those of their rivals (Pratama, 2016).

Technological advancements have permeated all aspects of life, including the service industry, which has experienced rapid growth in recent years, especially in Indonesia as one of Southeast Asia's largest markets (Brama Kumbara & Andri Wijaya, 2020). One such burgeoning service is online transportation. Gojek, operated by PT. Gojek Indonesia, was founded in 2011 (Qadir et al., 2017). In Indonesia, technology companies like PT. Gojek Indonesia operate in the online transportation sector, connecting drivers with passengers through modern technology. PT. Gojek Indonesia has played a pivotal role in this transformation by offering innovative services through its advanced platform. The company has consistently improved its service quality and offered competitive pricing (Yuliantri, 2017). To navigate the increasingly competitive market, PT. Gojek Indonesia requires effective marketing strategies to maintain and expand its market share.

The online service industry has become a focal point in the development of the digital economy, particularly with its dominance in Indonesia's online motorcycle taxi market (Elviera, 2021). Given the rapid advancements in technology, companies in this industry must continuously innovate to remain competitive. A sound marketing strategy is crucial for companies like PT. Gojek Indonesia. In this context, an integrated Red Ocean and Blue Ocean approach offers the potential for sustained competitive advantage.

Red Ocean represents a highly competitive business environment where companies compete for existing market share, while Blue Ocean involves creating new market space or identifying untapped market segments with less competition. Blue Ocean Strategy emphasizes the discovery and delivery of innovative and creative product features that are absent or overlooked by competitors. This approach allows businesses to create new markets or explore untapped segments with high growth potential and minimal competition. Unlike Red Ocean where competitors vie for market share in existing markets with similar offerings, Blue Ocean Strategy encourages businesses to avoid direct competition by creating new market space with unique and differentiated product features. Consequently, opportunities for sustainable business growth can be realized without getting caught in intense price-based competition (Shinta, 2013).

PT. Gojek Indonesia is a prime example of a company in Indonesia that has successfully adopted a combined Red Ocean and Blue Ocean approach. Initially entering the highly competitive online transportation market (similar to Red Ocean), Gojek quickly created a new ecosystem by adding supplementary services such as food delivery (GoFood), online payments (GoPay), and others. Through these service innovations, Gojek successfully created a new, untapped market space (Blue Ocean) in Indonesia's technology and online services industry. This innovation has provided numerous benefits to Gojek's founders and drivers. This strategy has helped Gojek not only compete with direct rivals but also position itself as a market leader in various service areas (Qadir et al., 2017).

By examining various factors influencing marketing strategies, SWOT analysis, and case studies of innovative marketing implementation, this article will explore and provide insights into how PT. Gojek Indonesia can integrate Red Ocean strategy a highly competitive and saturated market environment with Blue Ocean strategy an untapped market environment offering competitive advantages to expand its reach and strengthen its position in an ever-changing market.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research employed a literature review methodology to systematically gather information, theories, findings, and perspectives from various scholarly sources, including books, academic journals, newspapers, magazines, the internet, and encyclopedias. The process commenced with the identification and selection of relevant literature, followed by a comprehensive analysis of the collected data (Yusuf, Azhari, Amruzi, Wahidi, & Anafarhanah, 2022). This analysis involved identifying patterns, findings, and trends pertinent to the research topic. The information obtained from the literature review is then presented in a systematic and structured manner within this scholarly article (Pusparani, 2021). Moreover, a literature review enables researchers to identify relevant methodologies or theories by developing and identifying gaps between field relevance and existing theories within a study (Venyingtias Basuki et al., 2024).

RESULTS

Profile PT Gojek Indonesia

Established in 2010 by Nadiem Makarim, PT. Gojek Indonesia has been at the forefront of technological innovation in the transportation sector. Originally conceived as a motorcycle taxi service, Gojek has transformed the traditional transportation landscape through its sophisticated mobile application. This application facilitates seamless connections between passengers and drivers.

Prior to the introduction of the app, Gojek operated on a call-based booking system. Nevertheless, in 2015, the company launched mobile applications for Android and iOS (Wijoyo et al., 2023), ushering in a new era for Gojek and establishing it as a leading startup in Indonesia. Within a year, Gojek underwent a remarkable transformation from a mobile application to a leading multi-service platform. Driven by increasing competition in 2016, Gojek expanded its services with the launch of GoFood for food delivery and GoCar for car-hailing.

Recognizing the importance of convenient payment options, Gojek introduced GoPay as its digital payment solution. The flexibility of topping up GoPay balances through various methods, including bank transfers and direct payments to drivers, further enhanced user experience. To strengthen its payment ecosystem, Gojek acquired PonselPay in the same year. Furthermore, Gojek focused on expanding its delivery services through GoSend and forged strategic partnerships with marketplaces such as Tokopedia and Bukalapak.

Integration with popular chat applications like Line made Gojek services more accessible to users (Jumhadi et al., 2023).

Red Ocean

Red Ocean Strategy is a term coined by business theorists Kim & Maubrogne (2015) in their book, *Blue Ocean Strategy*. As the name suggests, the red ocean refers to a market characterized by intense competition, where companies vie for a larger share of an existing market. In this environment, industry boundaries are well-defined, and the rules of competition are established. Within the red ocean, companies compete to outperform rivals and capture existing market share. As markets become saturated and competition intensifies, the potential for profit and growth becomes limited. Products tend to become commoditized, and fierce rivalry transforms the red ocean into a battleground fraught with competition and uncertainty (Shinta, 2013).

A red ocean represents a market characterized by intense competition among numerous industries, organizations, institutions, or producers vying for market share. This highly competitive environment compels rivals to adopt one of two strategic approaches: product differentiation or cost reduction (Venyningtias Basuki et al., 2024). Due to the presence of numerous market players, red oceans are characterized by fierce competition and the emergence of unwritten rules. A red ocean is essentially a battleground where companies engage in price wars, add unnecessary features, and employ other strategies that ultimately increase costs without improving outcomes such as growth, revenue, or profit (Shinta, 2013). According to Kim and Mauborgne, red ocean strategy is grounded in the structural conditions of an industry, where established rules force companies to compete. This perspective is known as structuralism or environmental determinism. The term 'red ocean strategy' is used to describe a business competitive strategy characterized by bloody battles. Key characteristics of red ocean strategy include:

1. Competing within an existing market
2. Engaging in direct competition with rivals
3. Exploiting existing market demand
4. Negotiating value-cost trade-offs with competitors to maintain profitability
5. Integrating all company activities by choosing between product differentiation and cost focus (Kim & Maubrogne, 2015).

Red ocean strategy operates within a known market space where companies compete to win existing competitions, exploit existing demand, and make trade-offs between value and cost. This strategy involves integrating all company activities with a strategic choice between product differentiation or a low-cost focus, as well as creating or adding additional value to the products or services offered (Venyingtias Basuki et al., 2024).

To compete in the global market, companies must utilize SWOT analysis as a foundation for developing strategies that enhance their product competitiveness (Elyarni, 2016). Istiyanto (2019) further emphasizes the necessity of conducting SWOT analysis in formulating corporate strategies, as companies must strive to gain a competitive advantage through strategic means. The objective is to maintain a leading position in the industry and dominate the market. Moreover, SWOT analysis enables companies to make informed business decisions by assessing their own strengths and weaknesses as well as those of their competitors, thereby safeguarding the company from external threats (Suhendi, 2020).

A SWOT analysis reveals the following characteristics of the red ocean:

Strengths: The ease of market entry is a key strength of the red ocean, as it is a well-established market. Additionally, consumer demand is clear, and a customer base is already in place. This ease of penetration allows mature companies with superior competencies and quality to potentially dominate the market.

Weaknesses: The large number of competitors in the red ocean leads to intense competition, making it easy for consumers to compare prices and quality. The intense competition and established structure make it difficult for producers to improve quality while simultaneously increasing prices.

Opportunities: The red ocean offers equal opportunities for all businesses seeking to enter the market. The ease of entry provides a pathway for anyone willing to participate. For producers with superior resources, this is particularly advantageous. The ease of comparison for consumers creates an opportunity to attract potential customers, as even in highly competitive markets, market leaders always emerge.

Threats: The primary threat of the red ocean is intense competition, making it challenging for companies to survive. The ease of entry for new producers poses a significant threat to incumbents, who may be easily displaced.

Kim & Mauborgne (2005) argue that while most companies compete in red oceans, the red ocean strategy is increasingly unlikely to yield sustainable growth in the future.

Blue Ocean

According to Kim & Mauborgne (2005), Blue Ocean Strategy is a concept related to creating new market space where demand can be created and significant growth opportunities with high profits can be accessed. This definition emphasizes that blue ocean strategy does not focus on winning in existing markets but rather on creating new market space that renders competitors and competition irrelevant. Blue Ocean can be described as a new business frontier that can be created by companies through a practice known as value innovation. Blue Ocean Strategy is an approach used to address intense competition by creating innovative and creative products or services that can penetrate market segments overlooked by competitors (Shinta, 2013). Blue Ocean Strategy can be considered a strategy that may be necessary for companies to maintain a competitive advantage in an increasingly competitive business environment. Through this strategy, they can continue to produce innovative products that are in demand by their customers. With this approach, customers will continue to be satisfied with the various products offered. The blue ocean refers to unexplored markets without competitors, offering little or no competition for anyone who wants to take advantage of it, as the market is still untapped (L.C. et al., 2008).

Blue Ocean Strategy (BOS) is an approach to achieving market dominance by bringing a new perspective from various viewpoints. This new insight serves as a foundation for designing strategies to exceed the existing boundaries of typically rigid industries. One of the key characteristics of Blue Ocean Strategy (BOS) is value innovation, which differentiates it from Red Ocean Strategy (Suhendi, 2020). According to Kim & Mauborgne (2005), value innovation involves changes in cost structure and the value proposition offered to buyers. Value innovation is a combination of efforts to increase the benefits offered to buyers while reducing costs, without sacrificing either aspect. Blue ocean refers to industries or markets that have never been seen before, thus being unaffected by competition. In the blue ocean, demand is created rather than competed for, causing the size and demand of the market to be unlimited (Samrin & Irawan, 2021).

According to Kim & Mauborgne (1997), to develop a successful Blue Ocean Strategy, it is essential to use the Four-Actions Framework. This framework is designed to produce

strategies that simultaneously combine value innovation and low cost. In forming the Four-Actions Framework, there are four key questions that must be answered:

1. What factors can be eliminated?
2. What factors can be reduced?
3. What factors can be increased?
4. What factors have not been offered by the competition that can be created?"

In Blue Ocean Strategy, factors traditionally focused on to win competition are no longer the primary differentiators. However, this strategy still has a strategic logic at its core, known as value innovation. This concept integrates differentiation and cost control simultaneously. This is achieved by applying the Four-Actions Framework previously explained, by eliminating and reducing elements that are the focus of industry competition to reduce costs, while adding and enhancing elements not offered by the industry to create differentiation that provides added value to buyers (Shinta, 2013).

In creating a Blue Ocean Strategy, there are three key characteristics: Focus, referring to an emphasis on key points that are the center of attention. A company cannot spread its efforts across all aspects of its business. The company's strategy must clearly indicate where its business focus lies. Divergence or movement away, is the concept of moving away from competition with other competitors. This can be achieved by searching for and exploring alternatives and not getting caught up in comparisons with competitors. The goal is to break out of the existing game and create a new game. A compelling motto is also a major attraction for customers. Because a strong, clear, attractive, and honest motto will leave a good impression on potential and existing customers (Pollard, 2005).

Similar to Red Ocean, SWOT analysis has also been applied to Blue Ocean, with the following findings:

Strengths:

1. Innovative and allows companies to create new market space.
2. Enables companies to avoid direct competition with rivals.
3. Allows companies to generate high customer value.

Weaknesses:

1. The risk of failing to attract customers or generate new demand.
2. Requires significant investment of time and resources.

Opportunities:

1. The opportunity to reshape the industry.
2. The opportunity to create a new and different value chain.

Threats:

1. The risk of failing to understand the market or customers well.
2. The potential for market saturation or loss of interest in the innovation.

Tabel 1

Red Ocean	Blue Ocean
Enter an industry that is already saturated with competitors	Develop an industry untouched by other competitors
Compete to win competition	Make competition irrelevant
Exploit existing demand	Create own boundaries and new rules of the game
Choose between value-cost trade-off	Break the value-cost trade-off
Combine the entire system of company activities by choosing between differentiation or low cost	Combine the entire system of company activities in pursuing differentiation and low cost
Create or add value = additional value	Value innovation = innovative value

Integration Of Red Ocean And Blue Ocean Strategies By Pt. Gojek Indonesia

a. Product and Service Innovation

PT. Gojek Indonesia has successfully created various types of services such as GoRide, GoPay, GoFood, and many more that set it apart from its competitors. This is an example of how Gojek operates in a Blue Ocean by creating services that did not previously exist, while still maintaining service quality and operational efficiency (Red Ocean). Not only that, even though operating in a competitive environment (Red Ocean), PT. Gojek Indonesia still focuses on cost and operational efficiency to offer competitive prices to customers. On the other hand, they also continue to innovate in services and technology to differentiate themselves and create added value for their customers (Blue Ocean).

b. Pricing Strategy

Gojek employs a dynamic pricing strategy, focusing on financial feasibility for both users and driver partners. While they offer competitive prices in the market (Red Ocean), they also provide discounts and promotions to attract new customers and expand market share (Blue Ocean). In this regard, Gojek utilizes a flexible pricing approach by combining elements of both Red Ocean and Blue Ocean. This means they offer competitive rates to attract customers in a competitive market, while also providing discounts, promotions, and loyalty programs to entice customers and create new market space. This allows Gojek to maintain a balance between retaining existing customers and attracting new ones.

c. Service Quality and Customer Experience

To maintain its competitive edge, Gojek invests heavily in service quality and customer experience. This creates added value that differentiates Gojek from its competitors, transforming it into more than just a provider of transportation, food delivery, digital payments, and online shopping. With this, Gojek successfully creates added value for customers and creates new market space (Blue Ocean), while simultaneously maintaining operational efficiency and high service quality. Diversifying their services allows Gojek to reach a wider market segment and meet various customer needs (Red Ocean). Not only that, Gojek also understands customer behavior and needs, allowing Gojek to offer services that are more aligned with customer needs, strengthening customer relationships, and differentiating itself from competitors.

CONCLUSION

The integration of Red Ocean and Blue Ocean strategies in PT. Gojek Indonesia's marketing strategy enables the company to operate effectively and efficiently in a competitive market, while simultaneously innovating and creating added value for customers. By striking a balance between operational efficiency, flexible pricing, service innovation, and a customer-centric approach, Gojek has successfully positioned itself as a market leader in the on-demand services industry, particularly in Indonesia. This demonstrates that with the right approach, companies can achieve sustainable success in a dynamic and ever-changing business environment.

REFERENCES

- Brama Kumbara, V., & Andri Wijaya, R. (2020). ANALISIS STRATEGI PEMASARAN PADA PT GOJEK INDONESIA. 1(6). <https://doi.org/10.31933/JIMT>
- Elviera, C. D. (2021). IMPLIKASI STRATEGI PEMASARAN PT GOJEK TERHADAP PERILAKU KONSUMEN. *Jurnal Bisnis Net*, 2722–3574.
- Elyarni, R. (2016). Analisis SWOT Terhadap Strategi Pemasaran Layanan SAP Express pada PT. SAP. In *Jurnal Metris* (Vol. 17).
- Jumhadi, O., Mulyani, A. S., Ekonomi, F., Bisnis, D., Sultan, U., & Tirtayasa, A. (2023). PERKEMBANGAN INDUSTRI TRANSPORTASI OJEK ONLINE DI ERA 5.0 DARI PT. GOJEK INDONESIA. In *JCI Jurnal Cakrawala Ilmiah* (Vol. 2, Issue 6). <http://bajangjournal.com/index.php/JCI>
- Kim, W. C., & Mauborgne, R. (1997). Value Innovation: The Strategic Logic of High Growth. *Harvard Business Review*.
- Kim, W. C., & Mauborgne, R. (2005). *Blue Ocean Strategy: How to Create Uncontested Market Space and Make the Competition Irrelevant*. Harvard Business School Press, Blue Ocean Strategyton, Massachusetts.
- Kim, W. C., & Mauborgne, R. (2015). *Blue Ocean Strategy*.
- Kotler, P., & Keller, K. lane. (2010). *Manajemen Pemasaran*. Erlangga.
- L.C., K., Hannah, K., & Lewis, L. (2008). A pragmatic and holistic approach to strategic formulation through adopting balanced scorecard, SWOT analysis and blue ocean strategy – a case study of a consumer product manufacturer in China. *International Journal of Managerial and Financial Accounting*, 1(2), 127–146. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJMFA.2008.021238>
- Malihah, L. (2023). ANALISIS BAURAN PEMASARAN PADA HOME INDUSTRI WADAI KELEMBEN DESA TAMBAK ANYAR MARTAPURA MARKETING STRATEGY ANALYSIS ON HOME INDUSTRY WADAI KELEMBEN TAMBAK ANYAR VILLAGE MARTAPURA. *Jurnal Ekonomika*, 14.
- Malihah, L., & Meilania, G. T. (2023). Analisis Pengaruh Brand Ambassador Blackpink Terhadap Minat Beli Produk Oreo. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik (JISIP)*, 12(1), 220–232. www.publikasi.unitri.ac.id
- Malihah, L., & Nazairin, A. (2024). Sampah Plastik Sachet Dalam Perspektif Pembangunan Berkelanjutan. *YUME : Journal of Management*, 7(1), 198–210.
- Mubarak, Z., Faridah, R., Yuliani, R., Sukarni, & Fong, M. (2023). Does Sharia Dormitory Business Unit support Islamic University Sustainability? Market, Financial, and Maqashid Sharia Analysis. *IKONOMIKA: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis Islam*, 8(1), 37-52. [doi:https://dx.doi.org/10.24042/febi.v8i1.15990](https://dx.doi.org/10.24042/febi.v8i1.15990)
- Pollard, W. E. (2005). Blue Ocean Strategy's Fatal Flow. *CMO Magazine*.

- Pratama, D. F. A. (2016). THE ANALYSIS OF MARKETING STRATEGY IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIHOME PRODUCT USING BLUE OCEAN STRATEGY THEORY (A Study at PT. Telekomunikasi Indonesia, Tbk. STO Klojen Malang). *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa FEB*, 4(2).
- Pusparani, M. (2021). FAKTOR YANG MEMPENGARUHI KINERJA PEGAWAI (SUATU KAJIAN STUDI LITERATUR MANAJEMEN SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA). 2(4). <https://doi.org/10.31933/jimt.v2i4>
- Qadir, A., Wahab, Z., & Nailis, W. (2017). Analisis Penerapan Blue Oceans Strategy pada Service Marketing Mix terhadap Keputusan Penggunaan Jasa Gojek. *JEMBATAN-Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Bisnis Dan Terapan*, 14(1).
- Samrin, & Irawan. (2021). Formulasi Blue Ocean Strategy : Studi Kasus Kopi Gayo di Kabupaten Takengon. *Jurnal AKMAMI (Akuntansi Manajemen Ekonomi)*, 2(2), 410–420.
- Shinta, L. (2013). Blue Ocean Vs Red Ocean. *JURNAL KEUANGAN DAN PERBANKAN*, 1(1), 46–66.
- Suhendi, A. A. (2020). IMPLEMENTATION OF BLUE OCEAN STRATEGY (BOS) AT PT. ANEKA DIGITAL SUKSESINDO IN THE EFFORT TO INCREASE THE COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE AGAINST THE COMPETITORS. 1(3). <https://doi.org/10.38035/DIJEFA>
- Venyningtias Basuki, N., Sembiring, I. B., Valentino, A., Andarini, S., & Kusumasari, I. R. (2024). LITERATURE REVIEW: ANALISIS PENERAPAN BLUE OCEAN STRATEGY DAN RED OCEAN STRATEGY DALAM PERSAINGAN BISNIS. *Neraca Manajemen, Ekonomi*, 4(9), 16–26. <https://doi.org/10.8734/mnmae.v1i2.359>
- Wajdi, M., Barata, F., Syamil, A., Prasetyani, D., Tunjungsari, H., Aliyyah, I., . . . Aseri, A. (2023). Exploring the role of supplier integration, customer integration on operational performance by mediating the SMEs supply chain flexibility. *Uncertain Supply Chain Management*, 11, 1851-1858. doi:10.5267/j.uscm.2023.6.006
- Wijoyo, A., Jalal, A., Miranti, D., Aliansah, M., Velisa, S., & Kunci, K. (2023). Sistem Informasi Manajemen PT. Gojek Indonesia. *JRIIN: Jurnal Riset Informatika Dan Inovasi*, 1(4). <https://journal.mediapublikasi.id/index.php/jriin>
- Yuliantri, K. (2017). SWOT dalam Menentukan Strategi Pemasaran pada PT Gojek Indonesia. *Widya Cipta: Jurnal Sekretari Dan Manajemen*, 1(1), 92–99.
- Yusuf, M., Azhari, F., Amruzi, F., Wahidi, M., & Anafarhanah, S. (2022). Green Economy Financing According to Fiqh Al-Biah as Part of Maqashid Sharia. *PENA JUSTISIA: Media Komunikasi dan Kajian Hukum*, 21(1), 201-212. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.31941/pj.v21i1.2725